

## Reply to Taboada and Anadón: Critique of sea-level rise study invalid

In their letter, Taboada and Anadón (1) use an integral form of the sea-level formula that we have proposed (2), obtained simply by integrating our equation over time (Eq. 1):

$$H(t) = H_0 + a \sum_i (T(t_i) - T_0) + b(T(t) - T(t_0)) \quad [1]$$

Because Eq. 1 is equivalent to our equation, these authors, not surprisingly, obtain the same result as we do, with parameter values differing only insignificantly from ours as we verified using (Eq. 2)

$$\sum_0^{120} T(t_i) = -6.3\text{K}, T(t_{120}) - T(t_0) = 0.9\text{K} \quad [2]$$

and  $t_{120} - t_0 = 120$  years (Table 1).

However, the authors' discussion of the parameter fit relating to their figures 1 and 2 is simply wrong (1). In figure 1, they show a regression of sea level  $H$  vs. the integral over temperature  $T$  only—relative to an arbitrary reference level, which is the mean over 1951–1980—when the equation contains the integral over the difference  $(T - T_0)$ ; i.e., the second term in our Eq. (1) above. It is only the latter expression, with  $T_0$  designating preindustrial equilibrium sea level, that is nonarbitrary and makes physical sense.

Regressing the full sea-level  $H$  against  $T$  in figure 2 is similarly wrong (1). In Eq. 1, the  $b$  coefficient indeed expresses

**Table 1. Parameters of fit computed by the methods of ref. 1 and ref. 2, respectively.**

Parameter	Unit	Estimate from ref. 2	Estimate from ref. 1
$a$	cm/K per year	$0.56 \pm 0.05$	0.58
$T_0$	K	$-0.41 \pm 0.03$	-0.41
$b$	cm/K	$-4.9 \pm 1.0$	-4.5

a proportionality between temperature and sea level, but in figure 2, this dependence is drowned out by the much larger contribution of the terms in  $a$ , which our equation models as a dependence between temperature and the rate of sea-level rise ( $dH/dt$ ).

Only the sum of contributions as modeled by our equation correlates well with sea level; partial regressions like this do not work. Hence, neither of the graphs presented makes sense.

**Martin Vermeer<sup>a,1</sup> and Stefan Rahmstorf<sup>b</sup>**

<sup>a</sup>Department of Surveying, Faculty of Engineering Sciences and Architecture, Aalto University School of Science and Technology, FI-00076 Aalto, Finland; and <sup>b</sup>Department of Earth System Analysis, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research, 14473 Potsdam, Germany

1. Taboada FG, Anadón R (2010) Critique of the methods used to project global sea-level rise from global temperature. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 107:E1116–E1117.
2. Vermeer M, Rahmstorf S (2009) Global sea level linked to global temperature. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 106:21527–21532.

Author contributions: M.V. and S.R. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

<sup>1</sup>To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: martin.vermeer@tkk.fi.